藏学学刊

JOURNAL OF TIBETOLOGY

第 13 辑

四川大学中国藏学研究所 编

中国藏学出版社
Editors-in-chief  Huo Wei, Shi Shuo
Deputy Editor-in-chief  Zhang Changhong

Editorial Board  Pasang Wangdu (Chair, Tibetan Academy of Social Science, China)
Huo Wei (Sichuan University, China)
Shen Weirong (Tsinghua University)
Shi Shuo (Sichuan University, China)
Tsering Thar (Minzu University of China)
Zhang Yun (China Tibetology Research Center)

Dorji Wangchuk (Hamburg University, Germany)
Kapstein, Matthew T. (École Pratique des Hautes Études, France; University of Chicago, U.S.A.)
Klimburg-Salter, Deborah E. (University of Vienna, Austria)
vander Kuijp, Leonard W. J. (Harvard University, U.S.A.)
Scherrer-Schaub, Cristina A. (École Pratique des Hautes Études, France)
Tuttle, Gray (Columbia University, U.S.A)
Yumiko, Ishihama (Waseda University, Japan)

Editors  Chen Bo, Pelchan Dorje (Zhang Yanqing),
Garrang, Xu Yuanqin, Yang Qingfan,
Yudru Tsumu (Jin Hongmei), Zhang Changhong

Editorial Assistant  Sun Zhaoliang
目录

藏东地区大日如来与八大菩萨图像研究 ........................卢素文 达哇彭措 / 1
文本、图像和寺院组织：达丹彭措林寺佛教故事的初步探究
................................................................................安德鲁·昆特曼 科蒂斯·谢夫 / 32
瞿昙寺善财童子五十三参壁画及汉藏文化交流相关问题补论……董华锋 / 74

明代藏传佛教度牒制度探微 ............................................................... 阴海燕 / 83
明清时期嘉绒藏区的地域概念及其演变初探 .............................. 邹立波 / 96
康区“白利土司”考 ........................................................................ 李志英 / 107
清代早期西藏方志中的“康”及有关记载特点 .............................. 赵心愚 / 123
从清代档案看金川战略地位及其与藏区和内地的联系 .............. 王惠敏 / 138
清代西藏城市发展与寺庙的关系研究 ........................................... 王哲磊 / 151

拉萨甘丹寺“甘丹阿曲”法会诵经仪式音声研究 .......................... 王英杰 / 163
青藏高原的区域性形成和多样化模式：网状、等级与催化……杰拉德·罗谢 / 200
从日常生活看后藏农区的两性差异

——以日喀则市夏村田野观察为例..............................................谭斯颖 / 230

弗兰克与西部西藏历史研究

——兼论西部西藏考古的发端.................................................杨清凡 / 245

有关敦煌西域出土的古藏文契约文书的若干问题

.................................................................武内绍人 著 杨铭 杨公卫 译 / 269

摘要 ......................................................................................... / 283
# Table of Contents

A Study of Vairocana with Eight Bodhisattva Images Discovered in East Tibet
*Lu Sawen and Dawa Phuntsok*

1

The Life of the Buddha at Rtag brtan Phun tshogs gling Monastery in Text, Image, and Institution: A Preliminary Overview
*Andrew Quintman and Kurtis R. Schaeffer*

32

An Additional Discussion of the Wall Painting of Sudhana's Pilgrimage in Qutan Monastery and the Issues Related to the Sino-Tibetan Cultural Exchange
*Dong Huafeng*

74

An Inquiry into the *dudie* Certificate for Tibetan Buddhist Monks during the Ming Dynasty
*Yin Hai yan*

83

A Preliminary Study of the Geographical Concept of Rgyalrong and Its Evolution during the Ming and Qing Dynasties
*Zou Libo*

96

A Textual Study of the *Beri Tusi*
*Li Zhiving*

107

"Kang" in Gazetteers of Tibet in the Early Period of the Qing Dynasty and the Features of Their Accounts
*Zhao Xinyu*

123
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>On Jin Chuan's Strategic Position and Its Connection with Central Tibet and Inland China Based on the Archives of the Qing Dynasty</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wang Huimin</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Study of Monasteries and Urban Development of Tibet during the Qing Period</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wang Zhaolei</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Study of the Sound of Chanting Rituals in the Assembly of the <em>Dga' idan Inga mchod</em> at Ganden Monastery, Lhasa</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wang Yingjie</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Making Areas and Patterning Diversity on the Tibetan Plateau: Meshworks, Hierarchies, and Catalysts</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gerald Roche</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender Differences of People's Daily Life in Central Tibet's Rural Area: A Case Study of Xia Village</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tan Siying</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.H. Francke and the Initiation of Archaeology in Western Tibet</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yang Qingfan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Issues Regarding Old Tibetan Contracts from Dunhuang and Xinjiang</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Tsuguhito Takeuchi, translated by Yang Ming, Yang Gongwei</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstracts</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Life of the Buddha at Rtag brtan Phun tshogs gling Monastery in Text, Image, and Institution: A Preliminary Overview*

Andrew Quintman and Kurtis R. Schaeffer

Abstract: This essay presents a preliminary overview of a larger collaborative project on the narratives of Śākyamuni Buddha's life based on materials produced by the sixteenth/seventeenth-century polymath Kun dga' snying po, better known as Tāranātha (1575-1634), at Rtag brtan Phun tshogs gling Monastery in the Gtsang region of the Tibetan Autonomous Region. In this essay we introduce (1) Tāranātha's literary works on the Buddha, (2) the mural of the Buddha's life associated with that literature, (3) the complex relationship between text and image, a relationship that is mediated by a painting manual (bris yig) written by Tāranātha, and (4) the institutional context in which texts and images were produced. In doing so we hope to demonstrate that an extensively realized portrayal of Śākyamuni Buddha in multiple media was of central importance to the identity of Tāranātha's new monastic seat. Phun tshogs gling was, perhaps more than most monasteries in Tibet, branded with a distinctive vision of Śākyamuni. Tāranātha's emphasis on Śākyamuni as a central organizing principle formed what might be considered a "Buddha Program": a total cultural program consisting of a large body of Tāranātha's writings and religious artwork, as well as attendant practices. It was, in part we suggest, this Buddha Program that consolidated Phun tshogs gling's institutional identity.

* The authors would like to thank Leonard van der Kuijp and Robert Linrothe for their comments on previous versions of this essay.
Introduction

This essay presents a preliminary overview of a larger collaborative project on the narratives of Śākyamuni Buddha's life based on materials produced by the sixteenth/seventeenth-century polymath Kun dga' snying po, better known as Tāranātha (1575-1634), at Rtag brtan Phun tshogs gling Monastery in the Gtsang region of the Tibetan Autonomous Region. Tāranātha's construction of Phun tshogs gling began in the wood-rabbit year of 1615.¹ The site would grow to become an extensive complex. It eventually included a central building with a 36-pillared assembly hall that served as the monastery's primary ritual space, surrounded by numerous smaller temples and monastic residences, as well as a walled fortress atop the nearby ridge.

Tāranātha was renowned for his polymathic literary output, which covered philosophical exegeses, commentary on tantric theory and practice, Buddhist history, as well as the narrative literature addressed below. His seat at Phun tshogs gling, which became an epicenter of the Jo nang tradition in Tibet, remains a veritable treasurehouse of Buddhist material culture, perhaps most clearly witnessed in its expansive religious murals. Although converted to the Dge lugs sect during the time of the Fifth Dalai Lama, reports from the late-nineteenth- and early twentieth-centuries suggest it remained a thriving monastic community. Sarat Chandra Das notes the visit made by an associate in 1882, "The next day they came to Phuntsö ling, where there is a lamasery with five hundred inmates. This was formerly the seat of the Taranath lama..."² Swedish explorer Sven Anders Hedin visited the complex in 1907 and recorded that "two hundred monks belong to the monastery of Pinzoling."³

Scholars of Buddhist traditions in other regions of Asia have explored the synergies between Buddhist temple murals, narrative literature, and the architectural setting and ritual practices of the institutions that helped produce them. Such work has focused on, for example, sites at Ajanta in India and Dunhuang in China.⁴ Since at least the time of Giuseppe Tucci's monumental Tibetan Painted Scrolls, the institutional and intellectual contexts of murals have been a focus of scholarship on Tibetan art.⁵ The unique Tibetan archive of visual and literary materials extant at Phun tshogs gling allows scholars to explore issues such as the planning and design of visual narratives, the relationships between written and painted life stories, the economies of artistic production in a monastic setting, and forms of institutionally sponsored ritual consecration and worship. In this essay we introduce (1) Tāranātha's literary works on

² Das 1902: 209.
³ Hedin 1910, 1: 416.
⁴ See, for example: Schlingoff 2000; Whitfield 1990; Whitfield et. al. 2000; Fraser 2004; Ning 2004.
⁵ Notable examples include, but are certainly not limited to Vitali 1990; Klimburg-Salter and Luczanits 1998; Ricca and Lo Bue 1993; Goepper, Lutterbeck, and Poncar 1984; and of course Tucci 1949.
the Buddha, (2) the mural of the Buddha's life associated with that literature, (3) the complex relationship between text and image, a relationship that is mediated by a painting manual (bris yig) written by Tāranātha, and (4) the institutional context in which texts and images were produced. In doing so we hope to demonstrate that an extensively realized portrayal of Śākyamuni Buddha in multiple media was of central importance to the identity of Tāranātha's new monastic seat. Phun tshogs gling was, perhaps more than most monasteries in Tibet, branded with a distinctive vision of Śākyamuni.

Tāranātha's emphasis on Śākyamuni as a central organizing principle formed what might be considered a "Buddha Program": a total cultural program consisting of a large body of Tāranātha's writings and religious artwork, as well as attendant practices. It was, in part we suggest, this Buddha Program that consolidated Phun tshogs gling's institutional identity.

Text: How did Tāranātha Retell the Story of the Buddha?

The Sun of Faith: Structure

Tāranātha's composition, referred to in this essay as The Sun of Faith (Dad pa'i nyin byed), represents a major contribution to the seventeenth-century Tibetan literary imagination of Buddha Śākyamuni's life. It includes a complete narrative account of the Buddha's final life on Earth, beginning with his residence in Tuśita Heaven and concluding with his death, the distribution of his relics, and brief accounts of the first two monastic councils. The complete title is The Sun of Faith That Shines in One Hundred Directions: A Brief Account of the Acts of the Blessed Lord and Glorious Victor Śākyamuni, Lion of the Śākyas, King of the Śākyas, that is Delightful and Meaningful to Behold (Bcom ldan 'das dpal rgyal ba shākya thub pa shākya sengge'i rgyal po gang de'i mzaṅ pa mdo tsam brjod pa mthong bas don ldan rab tu dga' ba dang bcas pas dad pa'i nyin byed phyogs brgyar 'char ba). The work appears to have been well-known in Tibet, with multiple versions in circulation, and citations in later literature.

It is likely that Tāranātha developed his Buddha narrative for a number of years prior to composing The Sun of Faith. He gave teachings on the life of the Buddha to his patron, Sde pa Phun tshogs rnam rgyal (1550-1620) in 1617. Tāranātha began writing The Sun of Faith in the summer of 1621, a bird year. By the winter of that year it was complete. The text is, in his

---

6 Known editions are listed in the bibliography. Page numbers to Tāranātha's works, including the Dad pa'i nyin byed, below refer to the 2008 comparative (dpe bsud ma) edition published by Dpal brtsegs unless otherwise noted.
7 Kongtrul 2010: 89.
8 Zongse 1977: 351.
words, "a biography of the completely perfect Buddha compiled from the [texts of the] First Turning of the Wheel, primarily the Vinaya, and written in just the right length."

Although Tāranātha describes the work as a "brief account," it is one of the most extensive autonomous treatments of the Buddha's final life authored in Tibet at the time. It has been occasionally referred to by the abbreviated title The Hundred Acts (Mdzad brgya), although that seems not to have been the primary title by which it was known. Reference to the Buddha's "hundred acts" seems to acknowledge the narrative's extensive treatment of the Buddha's teaching career, which is indeed a distinctive feature of Tāranātha's work.

Tibetan authors have traditionally structured accounts of the Buddha's life story within a framework of twelve acts. While there is some variation among them, the general approach uses the following scheme: (1) descent from Tuṣita Heaven; (2) life in the womb; (3) birth; (4) education; (5) marriage; (6) renunciation; (7) austerities; (8) travel to Bodhgaya; (9) subduing Mārā; (10) enlightenment; (11) teaching; (12) death. Early examples of this structure include the extended account included in the History of Buddhism by Bu ston Rin chen grub (1290-1364), who may have been a target for Tāranātha's criticism, as discussed below. Tāranātha foregoes this 12-act structure altogether and instead narrates the arc of the Buddha's life over the course of 125 chapters.

The Sun of Faith is comprised of several distinct sections. The introduction (128-136) consists of several brief but important orientations to the work as a whole. It begins with verses of supplication (128-129), followed by a brief prose explanation of the author's intentions (129-130). A verse summary of the Buddha narrative comes next (130-131), followed by a numbered list of chapter chapter titles for the entire work, forming a table of contents to the text as a whole (131-136). Together the verses and the list form a useful mnemonic aid for readers venturing into the main text. The chapters themselves are, somewhat unusually, signaled with chapter number and title (or perhaps more accurately, topic) at the beginning rather than at the

---

9 Tāranātha, Rang rnam, smad cha, 103. Yang dag par rdzogs pa'i sanga rgyas kyi rnam thar 'dul ba lung gtso bor gyur pa'i 'khor lo dang po las btsus pa' rgyas bsdu 'tsham pa 'di yang dbyar thog de la sgrigs pa yin/ jug phran tshogs cig lo 'di dgon ka bris/.

10 See A khun ching Shes rab rgya mtsho's (1803-1875) list of rare texts, where it is referenced as Tā ra nā thā'i ston pa'i rnam thar mdzad brgyar grags pa (Chandra 1963, 638). It is worth noting another extended account of Śākyamuni Buddha's life that predates Tāranātha's version. This is the work by Sna nam btsun pa Skal bzang chos kyi rgya mtsho (ca. late 15th century) written in 1494 at the request of Chag Lo tsa ba Rin chen chos rgyal (b. 1447). The work is called The Supreme Treasury: The Excellent Life of the Lord Buddha, [Being] the Conduct of the One Gone to Bliss Described in terms of [His] Inerrant Acts (Sangs rgyas bcom ldan 'das kyi rnam par thar pa rmad du byung ba mdzad pa khrel med par brjod pa bde bar gshegs pa'i spyod pa mchog gi gter). Although in some ways comparable to The Sun of Faith, Sna nam btsun pa claims to draw on a much broader range of source materials than Tāranātha. See Sna nam btsun pa, Mchog gi gter.

11 See Tenzin Chögyel 2015, Kongtrul 2010: 75-91, etc.
end of each (For example: "don lnga pa mu tig can bden pa la bkod pa ni/n\textsuperscript{12}).

The hundred and twenty-five chapters that constitute the main narrative (136-471) cover several distinct periods of the Buddha's life. The Buddha's birth and his activities through the enlightenment, or acts one through ten in the twelve-act system, constitute chapters 1-25 (131-183). His teaching career takes up the bulk of work, spanning chapters 26-117 (183-444), or approximately 80% of the narrative portion of the work. The Buddha's death and cremation, and the distribution of his relics constitute chapters 118-120 (444-453). The final chapters 121-125 conclude the narrative with a discussion of the so-called first and second Buddhist councils (453-471). Tāranātha ends the narrative portion text with a brief resumé of seven stories (gtam rgyud) of the spread of Buddhism during and after the Buddha's life (472-473). Concluding verses bring the story proper to a close (473-474), at which point Tāranātha lingers in a colophon to offer thoughts on the process of crafting a Buddha narrative.

The Sun of Faith: Sources

The text's colophon (475-477) forms an extended reflection on the author's textual sources for the story and a justification for his approach to composing the Buddha's life story more generally. Tāranātha's reflection here is particularly interesting as it provides a rare account of literary critical reflection on the processes of Tibetan authorship: the determination of valid sources, the adoption of literary voice and style, and imagined reading audience.

Tāranātha uses the colophon to make a number of broad claims about his literary approach. Two issues seem to be critical. First, he wants to carefully demonstrate that competing traditions of the Buddha's life exist within early (Hīnayāna) and later (Mahāyāna) strands of canonical literature. Second, and perhaps more importantly, he presents an interpretive framework that allows him to argue that these literary streams are equally authentic and valid but that they should not be carelessly blended.

Tāranātha begins by acknowledging his explicit reliance on works from the Vinaya as sources for his narrative. He claims to draw on several specific works, including the "Four Collections," the Karmaśataka [D340]\textsuperscript{13}, the Avadānaśataka [D343], and "some minor sūtras as required." The Four Collections (lung sde bzhi) are the four compendia known more commonly as the "Four Vinaya Collections" ('dul ba lung sde bzhi), which in the Tibetan canonical collections are the 'Dul ba gzhi [Vinayavastu, D1], 'Dul ba rnam par 'byed pa [Vinayavibhanga, D3], 'Dul ba phran tshegs kyi gshi [Vinayaksudraka vastu, D6], and the 'Dul ba gzhung bla

\textsuperscript{12} Tāranātha, Dad pa'i nyin byed, 335.

\textsuperscript{13} Ui, Hakuji, et. al. A Complete Catalogue of the Tibetan Buddhist Canons, Sendai: Tōhoku Imperial University, 1934, no. 340, hereafter "D340", etc.
ma [Vinaya uttaragrantha, D7]. Our preliminary assessment shows these works, and the Vinayavastu in particular, to be key sources for Tāranātha.

An author of a Buddha-life story, Tāranātha continues, must "distinguish between [accounts from the] Mahāyāna and the Hinayāna." The author should thereby decide whether the presentation will accord with the ethos of the Mahāyāna or the Hinayāna, as understood by Tibetan intellectuals. The former is represented most clearly by the Lalitavistara and its narrative, which concludes with the Buddha's first teaching, could be completed by episodes drawn from other Mahāyāna scriptures, such as "stories of the supreme pair [Śāriputra and Maudgalyāyana] from the Mahāsamnipāta Sūtra (D138); stories from the Pitāputrasamāgamana Sūtra (D60) in the Ratnakuta Sūtra, the great miracles from the Damamukkanāma Sūtra (D341), and episodes about his death from the Mahāparinirvāṇa Sūtra." For sources from the Hinayāna tradition, Tāranātha suggests that the Abhinīṣkramanā Sūtra (D 302) could be augmented by accounts from the Karmaśataka and the Avadāṇāśataka.

Tāranātha contends that, while Hinayāna and Mahāyāna sources are equally valid, they serve different purposes. He therefore forcefully maintains that, in writing the entire arc of the Buddha's life from birth to death, the two traditions should not be mixed: "It is unacceptable to mix the two [types of scripture], for they become muddled, neither one nor the other, which is improper."

Tāranātha is quick to heap praise on Mahāyāna renditions of the narrative. It is superior to the Hinayāna tradition inasmuch as it is "more extensive [than the Hinayāna narrative]; an object of inconceivable wisdom; that which appears in the perception of the best disciples; the liberation story of the great esoteric tradition, and so forth." However, the Hinayāna tradition has a major advantage; it presents the Buddha narrative in human terms, making it more appropriate for ordinary, human readers." It is only the common system that establishes a foundation for various kinds of investigation," Tāranātha argues. The Hinayāna Buddha narrative focuses on "what was established in the perception common to all ordinary people, the extent of the Buddha's lifespan, the chronology [of his deeds], and the assertions that he went to this place but not that one." By contrast, "The Mahāyāna tradition cannot [serve that function.] It is the domain of the inconceivable. Therefore it is difficult [for this tradition] to ascertain that 'this alone is [the Buddha's] residence, time period, or deeds.'" The Hinayāna narrative is useful for Tāranātha because it emphasizes chronological sequence over the collapse of temporality, the particular places that the Buddha went rather than the idea that he is at once everywhere and nowhere. If in the Mahāyāna narrative the Buddha's life is beyond ordinary description, in the Hinayāna narrative precise details of those descriptions are of greatest import. Where the Buddha went, when he went there, and what he did there are, Tāranātha contends, all neatly

14 These sources are repeated in the Descriptive Guide to Phun tsogs gling. See Tāranātha, Gnas bshad, 176.
documented in "Hinayana" sources such as the Vinaya literature. "Therefore," Tāranātha concludes, "the common system [the Hinayana] is certainly much more important when talking about the composition of stories about the past (gtam rgyud)." Tāranātha ends this discussion by adding depth to a common term for narrative, gtam rgyud. For him, gtam rgyud tells a chronological narrative in which a sequence of episodes clearly describe the "who, what, where, and when" of a given subject's life. Here gtam rgyud bears comparison with other Tibetan terms such as lo rgyus, and perhaps even the English term "history." Hinayana narrative sources are useful for Tāranātha above and beyond Mahāyāna sources because they help him to tell the "history" of the Buddha, or perhaps the story of the Buddha in a more historical register.

In setting forth these assertions, Tāranātha claims to be correcting a mistake made by many Tibetan authors in the past, including an indirect reference that we surmise targets the famous historian and narrative author Bu ston Rin chen grub (1290-1364). Tāranātha writes, "I do not see as very suitable the [presentation] of the one known in Tibet as the Second Omniscient One, since he [composed] the first eleven of the twelve acts according to the Lalitavistara [a Mahāyāna text], and he filled out the final act according to the Vinayakṣudraka [a Hinayana text]." Finally, Tāranātha acknowledges the limitations of Tibetan authors who might seek to draw solely on scriptural sources from the Hinayana tradition. He notes, "Here in [Tibet] the scriptural collection of the śrāvakas was not transmitted in full, so I have related as much as I have acquired." Our preliminary analysis of the sources of Tāranātha's narrative bears out his claims to have relied on the Vinaya literature, and in particular the Vinayavastu, and to be primarily interested in presenting an authoritative sequence of "real-world" encounters between the Buddha and his disciples. This pragmatic approach seems to have been recognized as an important perspective on the distinct traditions of Buddha narrative available in Tibet. Kong sprul Blo gros mtha' yas (1812–1899) cites Tāranātha's colophon to The Sun of Faith in full at the conclusion of his own story of the Buddha's life set forth in his encyclopedic The Treasury of Knowledge (Shes bya kun khyab).\(^1\)

---

\(^1\) Kongtrul 2010: 89.
artwork by a European, following his visit to the monastery in 1904 (See Figure 1). He writes, "The walls are covered from top to bottom with frescoes, some beautifully executed, but all representing, in one way or another, the lewd figures so commonly reproduced in all Tibetan temples."\(^{16}\) Despite Rawling's somewhat Orientalist lens, it is remarkable that the Phun tshogs gling murals had caught the eye of non-Tibetan visitors during the early twentieth century.

Several decades later, Giuseppe Tucci further noted the importance of Phun tshogs gling's murals and provided a brief description of paintings found in several of its temples following "the tour that guides do with visitors."\(^{17}\) His survey focuses largely on the artwork of the monastery's central building, covering some ten different locations including the main assembly hall and several side chapels. Tucci describes the numerous protector shrines (mgon khang) in some detail, rightly highlighting their striking stylistic components. He seems, however, to have overlooked Tāranātha's Buddha life murals altogether.\(^{18}\) Another recent survey of the

---

\(^{16}\) Rawling 1905: 193-4.
\(^{17}\) Tucci 1949: 196-200.
\(^{18}\) Tucci 1949: 198.
artistic contributions at Phun tshogs gling likewise fails to mention the extensive Buddha life murals.\textsuperscript{19}

The murals appear to have been designed and executed within a year or two of winter 1621, when Tāranātha completed The Sun of Faith. The period between 1618-1622 was a time of tremendous artistic production at Phun tshogs gling. According to Champa Zongtse, whose detailed chronology of the 1610s through the 1630s is based in part on the Descriptive Guide to Phun tshogs gling (Dga' ldan phun tshogs gling gi gnas bshad), the foundation for the great central assembly hall (dbus kyi 'du khang gtsug lag khang chen mo) was laid in 1615, upon which a 34-pillar hall was built.\textsuperscript{20} (Figure 2, number 1) In 1616 and 1617 the roof was raised over the central assembly hall and the inner sanctum (dri gtsang khang chen mo), while foundations were laid for the surrounding temples. Murals in the great assembly hall, inner sanctum, and Akanīṣṭha temple were finished by 1618.\textsuperscript{21} That year, a group of some twenty Nepali artisans arrived to craft statues of the Seven Tathāgatas for the inner sanctum, a project

\textsuperscript{19} Henss 2014: 695-704.
\textsuperscript{21} Zongtse 1977: 29.
completed in 1620. In 1619 the murals of the main assembly hall were in production. By 1621 the new temple complex was being populated with statues, images, and murals, and by no later than 1622 the Jo bo Phyogs las nam rgyal statue was brought from the regional administrative center at Bsam grub rtse to anchor the inner sanctum of Phun tshogs gling. Much of Zongtse’s chronology awaits further analysis and corroboration, especially in relationship to the Descriptive Guide and Tāranātha’s autobiographical writings.

Aesthetic Description

The Descriptive Guide to Phun tshogs gling, which is typically included within Tāranātha’s collected works despite the fact that its authorship is uncertain, refers to these murals as the "Boundless Design" (bkod pa mtha’ yas):

---

Regarding the "Boundless Design" on the upper floor [Tāranātha] said, "The utterly amazing life story of our Teacher, the completely perfect Buddha, is based on a compilation from the Abhiniṣkramana Sūtra, the Karmaśataka, the Vinaya, and the Avadānaśataka," and then he explained how to make this and that [scene] accord with the story as much as possible.²⁴

Zongtse likewise refers to the second-floor ambulatory space as the "Boundless Design Circuit" (bkod pa mtha' yas 'khor yug).²⁵ (See Figure 3, number 5) This description of the visual narrative echoes the Tāranātha's approach to the literary version described above, an approach valorizing early vinaya literature in favor of Mahāyāna narratives more commonly adopted by Tibetan authors.

Tucci concludes his survey of artwork at Phun tshogs gling by noting, "In the atrium is painted Tāranātha's life. The style, a well-balanced blending of Indian and Chinese manners, may be called a good specimen of that art in which the different inspirations and characters of Tibetan taste met and were harmonized."²⁶ Tucci's description seems applicable to the "Boundless Array" paintings as well.

The aesthetic treatment of the Buddha life murals differs from paintings found elsewhere at Phun tshogs gling, especially those in the first-floor assembly hall and the Akaniṣṭha shrine on the third floor. The Boundless Array murals are less refined and exhibit a light, almost translucent, application of color.²⁷ Their narrative vignettes are complex and highly detailed arrangements, bricolages of individuated figures dressed in varicolored clothing. Human, divine, and demonic figures are represented with great liveliness and attention. We find lush depictions of flora including varieties of trees, flowering vegetation, and grasses. Scenes unfold in and around architectural structures ranging from ornate royal palaces to simple ascetic's huts carefully wrought from tree branches and thatch.

---

²⁴ Tāranātha, Gnas bshad, 175-6: steng khang bkod pa mtha' yas zhes bya ba di na/ 'o skol gyi ston pa yang dag par rdzogs pa'i sangs rgyas kyi rnam thar shin tu ngo mtshar ba' mngon par byung ba'i mdo dang/ 'dul ba lung dang/ las brgya pa dang/ rtogs brjod brgya pa sogs las bsdu pa'i bkod pa bzhuugs/ ces brjod nas lo rgyas dang bstan ci rigs ci rigs 'di dang/ 'di o zhes bshad do/.
²⁵ Zongtse 1977, 54: 'dus khang chen mo'i yang steng bkod pa mtha' yas zhes bya ba'i sdebs zhal khor yug gi bris char 'o skol gyi ston pa yang dag par rdzogs pa'i sangs rgyas kyi rnam thar ngo mtshar mngon par byung ba'i mdo dang/ dam chos 'dul ba lung dang/ las brgya pa dang/ rtogs brjod brgya pa so gs las bsdu pa'i bkod pa. This line is an unacknowledged quote from Tāranātha, Gnas bshad, 175-6.
²⁶ Tucci 1949: 198.
²⁷ Robert Linrothe has identified this technique as hang tson, "lightly filled-in color" or "light wash", as opposed to dzong tson or "fully filled-in color." Linrothe, personal communication, 4/16/2016. See also Linrothe 2016 and forthcoming, as well as Jackson 1996: 59.
Following his visit to Phun tshogs gling in 1919, Kaḥ thog Si tu Chos kyi rgya mtsho (1880-1923/25) noted the Buddha life murals and emphasized their extended environmental features: "On the outer surface of the temple are paintings of the hundred acts (mdzad brgya) along with the most wonderful landscapes, with an adjoining Trag shad protector chapel."\(^\text{28}\) Indeed, environmental elements dominate the wall space. Mountains, clouds, rivers, and pastoral ranges, serve to separate narrative episodes. Yet in a context where scenes often proceed in an irregular or nonlinear fashion, these environmental elements also provide visual cohesion across the entire mural space.

\textit{Layout and Plan}

The extensive Buddha life murals at Phun tshogs gling are situated in an open-air ambulatory space on the central building's second floor, a courtyard formed by a series of exterior walls. The space is accessed by one of several doors, in the south-west corner (leading to exterior stairs) and the middle of the north wall (leading to the first floor of the assembly hall). The

\footnote{28 Chos kyi rgya mtsho, Kaḥ thog 2001: 436: \textit{phyi ngos mdzad brgya bris pa yul bkod nyams mtshar ba trag shad mgon khang bca/}.}
mural walls are protected by a partial roof, whose overhang extends out approximately ten feet into the center of the courtyard. The roof was renovated in 2010, at which time a wooden screen was added at its edge, thus protecting the murals from water and other elemental damage while letting in natural light. Although access to the space can be controlled via the two doors, the ambulatory courtyard currently forms part of the monastery's public areas and is used to enter the various second-floor chapels. During Tucci's visit, it seems to have been part of the regular pilgrim's route. In 2011 we similarly witnessed numerous pilgrimage groups walking around the space to view the murals.

The painted narratives cover approximately 277 linear feet, creating some 1450 square feet of painted surface. The mural scape is divided into fifteen discrete "panels" (numbered 1-15), separated by architectural features such as windows and doors (See Figure 4).

The mural narratives closely follow the account in Tāranātha's The Sun of Faith. The story begins in the upper southwestern corner of the west wall (Panel 1) with the Buddha's existence in Tuṣita Heaven as Śvetaketu and his designation of Maitreyā as his regent. It then continues in a clockwise direction around the four walls of the courtyard, concluding on the southern wall of the south-west corner with the Buddha's death, the distribution of his relics, and the early monastic councils. Although not currently in use, the door in the south-west corner may have once provided access directly to the mural's narrative starting point. The single break in narrative flow appears in Panel 3, located in the middle of the west wall. This segment centers around a large icon of Śākyamuni who appears seated on a lotus cushion and lion throne with his hands in the gesture of touch the earth (bhūmisparśa mudrā). He is flanked by his two disciples Śāriputra and Maudgalyāyana. The left and right registers are filled with forty-two smaller figures that include Jo nang lineage holders, the so-called Six Ornaments and Two Masters, and the guardians of the four directions at the bottom. The emphasis on the figure of Buddha Śākyamuni in Panel 3 echoes the iconographic program of the first-floor inner sanctum (described below), whose space the image's flanking windows overlook. This disruption calls direct attention to the figure of Śākyamuni in the context of the masters associated with the monastery's lineage.

The Buddha's early life—his time in Tuṣita Heaven, his descent, birth, life in the palace, renunciation, defeat of Mārā, enlightenment, and the period immediately following his awakening—are briskly covered in the relatively constrained space of Panels 1 and 2. By far the greatest narrative space in the mural collection is given to stories that occur after the Buddha's enlightenment: these include accounts of his travels, his teaching disciples, and his performing miracles. These depictions cover Panels 4 through 14 and nearly two-thirds of 15. As with Tāranātha's literary work, the Buddha's teaching career constitutes more than 80% of the visual space. The visual narrative concludes in western third of the south wall (Panel 15), with depictions of the Buddha's final days, his death and cremation, the distribution of his relics, and the early Buddhist councils.
Text and Image: Tāranātha's Painting Manual between the Text and the Mural

As we have seen, Tāranātha produced extended narrative accounts of the Buddha's life story in both literary and visual forms. He was also keenly aware of, and deeply concerned with, the relationships between the two. In order to mediate the literary and visual, and effectively translate the former into the latter, Tāranātha composed a scene-by-scene painting manual, presumably to be used by those responsible for executing Phun tshog gling's extended Buddha life murals. The complete title of this work is A Painting Manual to the Hundred Acts of the Teacher Śākyamuni Written by Rje btsun Kun [dga'] Snying [po] (Ston pa shākya'i dbang po'i mdzad pa brgya pa'i bris yig rje btsun kun snying gis mdzad pa). Although the work's colophon is not dated, it informs us the text was composed by Tāranātha at the request of his patron, the prince of Gtsang Phun tshogs nam rgyal, at the Great Palace (Shigatse?).

The work contains 57 chapters, covering the entire arc of the Buddha's life story as told in The Sun of Faith. To illustrate the relationship between literary narrative, visual narrative, and the instructions within the painting manual, we turn now to one famous episode that takes place during the Buddha's teaching career. The episode, entitled "Establishing Muktālatā in the Truth," appears in Chapter 75 of The Sun of Faith. This is the story of the Sri Lankan lay woman Muktālatā (Muktāla), a well-known narrative extant in Vinaya and avadāna literature. Muktālatā's tale is a conversion narrative that takes place in two distinct locations: the princess's palace on the island of Singhala and the Buddha's residence in Śrāvastī. It recounts the travels of a group of Buddhist merchants back and forth across the sea as they visit the two central characters. The story is as follows.

Once, a Singhalese princess named Muktālatā heard merchants from the Central Country reciting scripture outside the palace window. A great feeling of peace came over her, so she asked the merchants what kind of music they sang. They replied that the sounds were the words of the Buddha. Muktālatā had never heard the word "Buddha" before, yet it filled her with emotion. As the merchants prepared to return to the Central Country, Muktālatā gave them a letter to offer to the Buddha. Learning of the princess's interest in him and his teachings, he gave the merchants a portrait of himself to offer to Muktālatā when they returned to Singhala. He further instructed them to display the image in a public space and to explain the painting's

---

29 Tāranātha, Bris yig, 501: de litar na ston pa'i rnam thar bris yig 'di nī/ sa la spyod pa'i dbang phyag phun tshogs rnam par sgyal ba'i gsung gi bsksul nas/ kun dga'snyin pos pho brang chen por nges bar brjod pa'o/
31 See Vinayavastu ("Dul ba gzhī"), Sde dge bstan 'gyur D1, vol. Ga, fol. 225a.3-229a.4.
32 See Chapter 7, Dge ba'i dbang po (Kṣemendra), Byang chub chos dpa'i rtags pa brjod pa dpag bsam gvyi 'khris shing (U1 1934, no. 4155): fol. 70b.5-79b.2. Tucci 1949: 449; Kṣemendra 2001: 59.
significance to the princess. Returning to the island, the merchants displayed the image upon a throne to great public praise. The princess learned basic Buddhist doctrine from the merchants, in exchange for which she gave them three baskets of pearls to offer to the Buddha, which they did upon their final return journey.

In what follows, we present the story of Muktālatā as depicted in the mural, The Sun of Faith, and the Painting Manual. As is typical of the mural overall, the visual narrative is spatially embedded within other narratives (figure 5), perhaps the most prominent example of which here is the rainbow bridge that extends over the ocean and over Muktālatā's palace, but that belongs to a different narrative vignette. Here we focus on the scenes pertaining to the Muktālatā narrative, leaving aside the interesting strategies used by the artists to interleave distinct narratives within a single visual space. The mural, the literary narrative, and the painting manual content relate to each other in complex ways. Artists, for example, appear to have arranged events in the Muktalata story according to geographic rather than temporal order. This means the viewer walking in traditional clockwise fashion first encounters India and then Singhala, even though the literary account begins in Singhala. The valorization of geography over temporality, found elsewhere in Buddhist art, underscores the divergences between literary and visual narrative logic.33

In order to walk the reader through these relationships, we follow the narrative sequence of The Sun of Faith, and incorporate both the mural scenes and the painting manual instructions according to that sequence. However, the Painting Manual's sequence of instructions for rendering the narrative in visual form does not adhere strictly to the chronology of events in The Sun of Faith. In order to preserve the sequence in The Sun of Faith, we have therefore presented the instructions in the Painting Manual out of their original order. To compare the two sources, we have assigned numbers to each of the twenty-one distinct instructions in the Painting Manual (numbers P1 through P21: "P" for Painting Manual). Specifically, out of the twenty-one distinct instructions, numbers P6 through P10 are out of sequence in relationship to The Sun of Faith, and are thus placed in the presentation below between P17 and P18 so that they line up with the The Sun of Faith's literary narrative.

We have placed these numbers in three places: (1) at the beginning of the instruction as it appears in the Painting Manual; (2) its corresponding narrative element within The Sun of Faith; and (3) upon the corresponding visual narrative element in the mural scene. Reading the Muktālatā story with this apparatus in mind, it becomes possible to see the creative relationships between the two versions of the narrative, the literary and the visual, relationships that are mediated by the careful instructions of the Painting Manual.

33 Personal communication, Robert Linrothe, 4/16/2016,
Establishing Muktālāṭa in the Truth

Figure 5. Mural location in Panel 11 (Figure 4, no. 11)

Figure 6. Overview of Muktalata Story (viewed right to left)
While the Buddha was living in Śrāvasti, Muktālatā, the daughter of the king of Singhala, rose to greatness. Her intelligence was clear, her mind was honest, and she was skilled in all things.

[P1-2] At this time some merchants from the Central Country had set up camp for the night near the palace of the King. When they awoke at dawn they recited verses from sutras.

[P1] In one area draw a distant island that is bounded by a large shoreline. [P2] In one section of the island draw a mansion, a palace, and a house with leafy vegetation.
Muktālā heard them through a window, and a feeling of peace came over her. In the morning she asked the King about this, and then [P4] she called to the merchants, "Play that music from the Central Country!" The merchants said, "Lady, this is not music. It is the word of the Buddha!" Never before had Muktālā heard the name "Buddha," yet no sooner than she heard it now, her hair stood on end with pleasure. What is this word, "Buddha"? she asked.

From the palace window a young woman listens. At the edge of the city are many merchants, and at the edge of them several merchants are reciting [verses]. [P4] In the foreground draw the noblewoman and her retinue speaking to the merchants.
[P5] The merchants told her all about him, and she gained a faith without equal. Later, when the merchants had finished their business and were preparing to return to their country, Muktālā gave them a letter to offer to the Buddha. The letter said: "Praised by gods, demigods, and humans,/ Escaped from birth, illness, and fear./ A renowned leader, famous far and wide./ Compassionate Sage, please grant a portion of your nectar." The merchants gave the Muktālā's letter to the Buddha, and the Buddha asked the merchants to describe the matter in detail. "When you sail again to Singhala," he Buddha said to the merchants, "you must let me know."

[P11] Later, when the merchants had finished trading their merchandise,

[P11] Draw two scenes of merchants on their boat in the water; one going here [Buddha] and one going there [Island].
[P12] they went before the Buddha.

[P12] On the shores here, in a country with plains, mountains, forests, and so forth the merchants are giving the letter to the Buddha in a temple.
[P13] Then the Buddha instructed artists to paint his image on cotton canvas. But the artists were not able to capture his features.

[P13] In front of another temple, in front of the Buddha, painters are rendering a likeness of the Buddha on a stretched cotton canvas.

[P14] Then light rays pierced the surface of the canvas in the outline of his body. [P15] The artists then added the color and completed the painting. [P16] As in the tale of King Udāyana, when they wrote words on the canvas, the words of the noble eightfold path just appeared.

[P14] In another area light rays emit from the Buddha’s body, strike the surface of the canvas, and illuminate the shape of his bodily form.

[P15] [The painters] apply the color.

[P16] The scribes write the text upon the top and bottom of the painting.
The Buddha explained the meaning of these words at length to the merchants. Then he said, "Go on to Singhala. Tell the king that this painting is a gift for Muktālatā. When there are large crowds assembled in his land, [he should] display the painting with great ceremony. If Muktālatā questions you on the details of the painting, you should explain them to her."

[P17] They place the painting in a container, and the Buddha entrusts it to the merchants.
[P6] The merchants listened to his instructions and departed. They [traveled to Singhala] and spoke to the King. The king had the country prepared, and arranged countless victory banners raised high.

[P6] Without interfering with the island surface, draw many merchants revealing the painting of the Buddha, holding it high.
Crowds of people gathered to see the image of the painting upon a throne of jewels. With voices raised high, together they proclaimed "Homage to the Buddha!" All were established in faith.

[7] The woman, the king, and many people make offerings.

[8] In the sky above gods make offerings, and a rain of flowers descends.
Muktālātā considered the twelve links of dependent arising in forward and reverse orders. The merchants recited this three times, though she understood it on the second time. As they recited it the third time Princess Muktālātā became established on the path to enlightenment.

In the mansion upright figures clasp their hands in front of a painting. Light emits from the figures.
Sun of Faith

[P10] When the time came for the merchants to return, Muktālatā said to them, "Please pay homage to the Buddha in my name. Ask if he is well, and give these three large bowls of pearls to him. The first is for the Buddha; the second for the Dharma, and the third for the monastic community."

Painting Manual

[P10] In the foreground the woman and her retinue pile many pearls into a container and give it to a merchant.
[P18] In another area the Buddha is in a temple with monks. The merchants offer him the letter and a box.

[P19] The box is opened, and the three shares of pearls are divided.
Ânanda asked [the Buddha], "From which rebirth did this happen?" [The Buddha replied,] "Rohikâ servant of Mahâñâman was born as the King's daughter. This was her good fortune. Now, build a temple with an inner chamber with the portion [of pears] for the Buddha. Give the dharma's portion to people who are upholding the dharma. Distribute the portion for the sangha evenly among the monastic community."

[P20] In the background of that country there are oysters holding pearls on the water and the plains, which are filled with precious jewels, and forests filled with elephants.

[P21] The women in the houses must be only noblewomen.
Institution: How Did Tāranātha Reimagine the Buddha in an Institutional Context?

The previous section on Muktilatā gives a sense of how Tāranātha's literary and visual narratives worked in harmony to foreground the Buddha’s life story at Phun tshogs gling. Tāranātha's *Sun of Faith* and the narrative related murals were impressive achievements. Yet they were not the only buddha-related materials he produced at Phun tshogs gling. Rather, the figure of Śākyamuni Buddha was a persistent and repeated theme in Tāranātha's writing and in his monastery's religious artwork.

Other Literature about the Buddha

Tāranātha wrote no less that ten works of varied length on the Buddha. A thorough analysis of these works in relationship to each other will no doubt reveal both complexity and depth in his portrayal of the founding figure. Even a quick survey shows that he utilized multiple genres of writing to evoke the Buddha. One early work is Tāranātha’s *Praise of the Bhagavan Lord of Sages,*34 which he composed in 1600 at the age of 25 in the Ra sa 'phrul snang gi gtsug lag khang. He wrote a manual on iconometry of the Buddha, the *Calculations for Proportions of the Victor’s Body, the Source of Well Being,*35 which he taught at Nags rgyal gyi dben gnas, as well as *Instructions for Combining Recollection of the Buddha and Guruyoga,*36 which was written at the request of one Bzang ldan pa Dge slong Kun dga' bde legs. Related to this is the *Brief Explanation of the Sūtra Recollecting the Three Jewels.*37 Finally, he dedicated Chapter Three of his massive, twenty-five chapter anthology of sādhana, the *Sgrub thabs rin chen 'byung gnas,* to various iconic representations of Śākyamuni Buddha.38 More pertinent here, he included in Chapter Sixteen a sādhana to the Seven "Hero Buddhas," the Sangs rgyas dpa' bo bdun,39 who are none other than the Seven Tathāgatas who inhabit the inner sanctum at Phun tshogs ling.

The *Rin chen 'byung gnas* was completed in 1608 at Jo nang,40 suggesting that Tāranathā had been developing the ritual components of the "Buddha Program" for at least two decades prior to the construction of the monastery. It is tempting to imagine that Tāranātha self-

---

34 Tāranātha, *Bcom idan 'das.*
35 Tāranātha, *Rgyal ba'i sku guugs.*
36 Tāranātha, *Sangs rgyas rjes dran.*
37 Tāranātha, *Dkon mchog gsun.*
40 Tāranātha, *Ye shes rgya mtsko,* 31: 312.
consciously developed a "Buddha Program," in the sense we are using this term, throughout the period he created Phun tshogs gling Monastery, though the evidence for this is circumstantial. We have not found explicit reference to such a plan in his writings. Nevertheless, taken as a whole, Tāranātha's writings on the Buddha, spanning at least years 1600 to 1621, make use of narrative, poetry, exegesis, and ritual instruction to engage his audience through aesthetic appreciation, emotional involvement, ritual action, imagination, and intellectual work. When combined with the visual renderings of the Buddha's life that are embedded within an architectural setting that is, in part, designed for ritual activity, the combination suggests a powerful system for bringing the Buddha "to life" within the walls of Phun tshogs gling. This is even more evident if we add to the foregoing the extensive painting and sculpture treating the Buddha elsewhere in the complex.

_Buddhas of the Main Assembly Hall_

Even before Tāranātha executed the narrative murals described above, he maintained a strong interest in visual depictions of the Buddha's life story. In his _Autobiography_, Tāranātha notes that, at about the time he finished writing the _Painting Manual_, he also commissioned a set of
60 thangka scroll paintings of the Buddha's life story.\textsuperscript{41}

Visual representations of the Buddha would later appear throughout the monastic complex in both iconic and narrative forms contributing to the Buddha Program. The most extensive of these is the four walls of the monastery's central assembly hall in the \textit{gtugs lag khang}. This space is dominated by 40 representations of the Buddha, approximately 10 feet high and depicted in a wide range of iconographic poses and artistic styles (See Figure 22). Illustrations of the sixteen arhats, Indian \textit{siddhas}, the kings of Shambhala, and innumerable other figures crowd the spaces between these giant buddhas. The assembly hall was originally embellished with scenes, no longer extant, of the Buddha's previous lives drawn from Aryaśūra's \textit{Jātakamālā} and painted on 34 of the hall's 36 great pillars. \textsuperscript{42}

The assembly hall murals were executed during the years 1618-1619 and rendered with great sophistication and expertise.\textsuperscript{43} Compared to the second-floor narrative murals, they exhibit a highly refined aesthetic sensibility in line, color, and composition. The entire assemblage deserves a careful analysis of both style and content than is not possible in the present essay. What follows is a brief survey of its overarching iconographic program.

The \textit{Descriptive Guide} recounts the themes of the assembly hall paintings in the following way:

The murals in the gallery of the chapel consist of (1) laying out the respective introductory settings [in which the Buddha taught] the so-called "twenty \textit{sūtras} of definitive meaning"; and (2) how the \textit{Kālacakra Root Tantra} and the \textit{Mañjuśrī Root Tantra} were taught. These are enhanced with various examples of the acts of the totally perfect teacher, the Buddha. \textsuperscript{44}

Inscriptions for each of the forty buddhas, transcribed in Appendix 1, appear in the lower

\textsuperscript{41} Tāranātha, \textit{Rang rnam}, smad cha, 89. \textit{Sgag sor zhab drung gong ma da'i dgongs brtad du 'dug pa nged kyis bris yig kyang byas/ yang dag par rdzogs pa'i sangs rgyas kyi rnam thar zhing bkod rgyas pa/ thang ka drug cu skor yod pa yang skabs der grub song/}.

\textsuperscript{42} Tāranātha, \textit{Gnas bshad}, 174; Zongtse 1977, 52. "On the faces thirty four pillars (which are all but the two great pillars), are arranged [murals] of the acts of the thirty-four rebirths of the Bodhisattva according to the text composed by Master [Ārya]śūra. Additionally, between each sūtra scene are depictions of the sixteen arhats and the authoritative dharma kings who went to Shambhala. Ka ring gnyis ma gto gs pa'i ka ba sum cu so bshi'i shu'i ngos la/ byang chub sems dpa'i 'khrungs rabs so bshi slob dpal dpa'i bos mdrad pa'i gzhud dang mithun par bkod/ yang mdo bkod kyi bar bar na bzhus pa/ 'di rnam/ 'phags pa'i gnas btsan chen po bcu drug dang/ dpal ldan sham bha lar byon pa'i chos rgyal rigs ldan rnam s kyi sku bruyan yin lags/. The scenes on the pillars no longer remain."

\textsuperscript{43} Zongtse 1977: 30.

\textsuperscript{44} Tāranātha, \textit{Gnas bshad}, 174: nges don mdo rgyi sri zhes gsangs pa'i gleng gzi so so'i mdo bkod dang/ dus kyi 'khor lo rtsa ba'i rgyud dang/ 'jam dpal rtsa rgyud gsungs tsul dang/ gzhans ston pa yang dag par rdzogs pa'i sangs rgyas nyid kyi mdrad pa'i rnam grangs ni rigs pa dang bcas pa spel nas bkod pa yin pa 'dug. Cf. Zongtse 1977: 52.
register. Although thirteen inscriptions are illegible or currently inaccessible, the extant 27 generally support the Descriptive Guide’s account.45

The Buddha figure encountered first when circumambulating the hall in the traditional way (Figure 22, number 1) appears to represent the Buddha performing the miracle of taming the mad elephant, perhaps reflecting the origin story of his Jo bo Phyogs las ram rgyal statue that sits in the inner sanctum. At least three images represent important narrative episodes from the Buddha’s life story: teaching dharma to the gods at Jāvlinī (27), teaching his mother in the god realm (37), returning to the world from the god realm (40). The majority of the massive paintings, however, depict the Buddha in the act of teaching the discourses fundamental to the Jonang tradition as transmitted by Tāranātha. These include the texts known as the "twenty sūtras of definitive meaning" (nges don gyi mdo nyi shu).

Dol po pa Shes rab rgyal mtshan (1292-1361), revered as the founder of Jo nang’s religious tradition, received extensive teachings early in his education at Sa skya Monastery on the so-called five "sūtras of definitive meaning" (nges don mdo).46 These five texts include:

1. Pañcaśatiṣṭhāprajñāpāramitā sūtra, Sher phyin lnga brgya pa (D15)
2. The "Chapter Requested by Maitreya" (Byang chub sms bs lab pa rab tu dbye ba’i le’u cha gnyis geig tu byas pa byams zhus su’ang grag pa), versions contained in Pañcavinīśatisāhasrikāprajñāpāramitā sūtra (D009) and Aṣṭādāśīśahasrikāprajñāpāramitā sūtra (D010) 47
3. Ghanavyūha sūtra, Rgyan stug po bkod pa’i mdo (D110)
4. Praśāntavinīścayaśrābhīṣṭhārasamādhi sūtra, Rab tu zhi ba rnam par nges pa’i chos’ phrul gyi ting nge ’dzin kyi mdo (D129)
5. Ratnāmegha sūtra, Dkon mchog sprin gyi mdo (D239)

These would later serve as the foundation for his seminal and controversial philosophical view known as extrinsic emptiness (gezhan stong), a system of thought to which Tāranātha became heir.48 Dol po pa further expanded this list to form the "ten sūtras of definitive meaning" by adding:

45 Yan Xue (2014) has also examined these murals. It appears she was able to view some inscriptions that were inaccessible or illegible to us. The authors would like to thank Hillary Yao for her assistance Yan Xue’s work.
46 Stearns 2010: 12, 316n28. See, for example, Dol po pa’s Zhu don gnang ba (appended to the Slo ma la spring ba skur ’debs sgro ’dogs spang ba), which sets forth his lists of the sūtras of definitive meaning and the tathāgatagarbha sūtras.
47 See Brunnholzl 2015, note 20 for an extended discussion of this work.
1. Suvarṇaprabhāsottama sūtra, Gser 'od dam chen gyi mdo (D556)
2. Saṃdhinirmocana sūtra, Dgongs pa nges par 'grel pa'i mdo (D106)
3. Lāhāvātāra sūtra, Lang kar gshegs pa'i mdo (D 107)
4. Sarvabuddhaviṣayāvatāraṃśuñānālokaśākāra sūtra, Ye shes snang ba rgyan (D100)
5. Buddhāvatāṃśa sūtra, Sangs rgyas phal po che (D44)

Dol po pa also drew upon corpus of canonical materials that laid out a theory of buddha nature (tathāgagarbha), a collection he categorized the so-called ten "tathāgatagarbha sūtras" (snying po'i mdo). In Dol po pa's view, these include: 49

1. Tathāgagarbha sūtra, De bzhin gshegs pa'i snying po'i mdo (D258)
2. Avikalppapravesadhāraṇī, Rnam par mi rtog par 'jug pa'i gzungs (D4000) in Bstan 'gyur
3. Śrīmālādevī sūtra, Lha mo dpal phreng seng ge sgra'i mdo (D92)
4. Mahābhārata sūtra, Rnga bo che chen po'i mdo (D222)
5. Aṅgulimālīya sūtra, Sor mo'i phreng ba la phan pa'i mdo (D213)
6. Śūnyatānāma mahāsūtra, Stong nyid chen po'i mdo (D291)
7. Tathāgatamahākuruṇḍinirdeśa sūtra, De bzhin gshegs pa'i thugs rje chen po bstan pa'i mdo (D147)
8. Tathāgataagunajñānācintayaviṣayāvatāranirdeśa sūtra, De bzhin gshegs pa'i yon tan dang ye shes bsam gyis mi khyab pa'i bstan pa'i mdo (D185)
9. Mahāmegha sūtra, Sprin chen po'i mdo (D232)
10. Parinirvāṇasūtra and Mahāparinirvāṇa sūtra, Myang 'das chen po (D119-121).

Taken together, these two groups of ten texts form the "twenty sūtras of definitive meaning" that form the doctrinal basis of Jo nang's religious tradition. 50 And it is these seminal works that the assembly hall Buddha murals are meant to represent. At present, seven of the twenty texts (noted in bold above) can be identified. The remaining works are likely among those figures with illegible inscriptions.

The assembly hall murals thus form a cohesive set that collectively represent the canonical foundation for Phun tshogs gling's broader monastic institution. Although the texts per se do not appear, the murals serve as indexical reminders of their doctrinal content and philosophical

50 These lists were commented upon and amended by later Tibetan writers, See Brunnholzl 2015: 4-12, for lists according to other traditions.
view, taught by the Buddha of our age. Śākyamuni repeatedly appears in the act giving voice to those discourses that would be marked as *buddhavacana*—"buddha-voiced" or authoritative—for Jo nang's religious transmissions. Systematic integration of this sort between temple art and philosophical view seems to be unusual Tibet, though this requires further comparative research among other extant examples of mural art. What the monumental images of the Buddha in various teaching scenes do do, however, is to connect the Jo nang tradition's persistent concern with establishing an authoritative corpus of the Buddha's key teachings with the artistic effort to integrate the Buddha into the institutional space in multiple ways.

**Buddhas of the Inner Sanctum**

The Buddha program becomes still more complex as one moves past the murals of the main assembly hall into the smaller central chapel. At the center of Phun tshog gling's ritual space lies the inner sanctum (*dri gtsang khang*), accessed via an entryway on the west side of the assembly hall. The walls of the chamber are covered with impressive murals of tantric deities and a portrait of Tāranātha. But its central images, and thus the main icons of the Phun tshogs gling monastic complex itself, were the seven Tathāgatas (*de bzhin gshegs pa bdun*), representing seven buddhas who span past and present eons. In 1618 a group of twenty Nepali craftsmen arrived to begin working on the series. The first three statues were finished in 1619 followed by the remaining four a year later. The central image was Śākyamuni, said to have been 23 hand-spans (*mtho*) high. The remaining six were smaller at 12 hand-spans. The seven images were constructed on a grand scale, befitting the principal icons of a large monastic institution. Their production required more than 800 *khal* of copper and some 7,000 *zho* of gold. According to the *Descriptive Guide* they were arranged in as follows:

To [Śākyamuni's] right sits Lord Vipaśin. To its left sits Lord Śīkhin. To [Vipaśin's] right is Tathāgatha Viśvabhū. To [Śīkhin's] left is Krakucchanda. These are facing east. The ones to the right are facing north. To their right facing north is *sambuddha* Kanakamuni; to their left facing south is *sambuddha* Kāśyapa.

---

51 The *Descriptive Guide* (173-4) lists the following murals: (1) 5-deity Kālacakra; (2) Dark Cakrasaṃvara in the tradition of Zhabs together with the 4 yoginis; (3) Vajravega; (4) Vajrabhairava; (5) Guhyasamāja-Mahājuvajra; (6) Vajrayogini; (7) the Great Omniscient One [Dol po pa]; (8) Pañjara Mahākāla yama-yami; and (9) Vaiśravana; as well as an image of Tāranātha as a "practitioner of the six buddha families" (*rgyal ba rigs drug sgrub pa po'i tshul du rje btsun nyid kyi sku 'dra*).


Tāranātha describes his rationale for this iconography in the following way (figure 23):

In terms of how the Buddha's teachings actually existed in India, the tradition of making statues of the seven tathāgatas and praying to them was very widespread. I have set them up here so that this distinctive tradition may be seen in a widespread way.\(^{55}\)

Indeed, iconography of the seven tathāgatas was widespread in India, both in traditional Buddhist literature and visual culture.

In the center of the room sat the monastery's most precious relic, a Jo bo Śākyamuni statue called Phogs las rnam rgyal, "All Victorious" (figure 23, number 8). The image was a gift of Tāranātha's patron Phun tshogs rnam rgyal and arrived at Jo nang Phun tshogs gling in 1621. Tāranātha's *Descriptive Guide* sets forth the icon's miraculous origins in India and its subsequent links to the Tibetan imperial court during the time of Srong btsan sgam po. Tāranātha likewise compares the image with two other great statues of Tibet's imperial period: Ra mo che's Jo bo Mi bskyod rdo rje and the Lha sa 'Phrul snang Gtsug lag khang's Maitreya

---

\(^{55}\) Tāranātha, *Gnas bshad*, 169.
Dharmacakra (Byams pa chos kyi 'khor lo). A more detailed account of the Jo bo Phyogs las rnam rgyal will be provided elsewhere.\textsuperscript{56} It is sufficient here to note this Śākyamuni image was understood as conferring upon Phun tshogs gling a religious legitimacy on par with those of the great institutions of Lha sa.

\textit{Buddhas of the Akaniṣṭha Chapel}

On the third story of Phun tshogs gling, seated above its Inner Sanctuary, lies the Akaniṣṭha Chapel (\textit{'og min lha khang}) (See Figure 3, number 2). The space is dedicated to a representation of the highest level of the Form Realm (\textit{gzugs khaps}) according to traditional Buddhist cosmology. Its central icon was a lifesize image of Amitāyus (\textit{tshe dang ye shes dpag tu med pa}). The statue was consecrated in 1626, during a period of great drought, and following the ritual it is said to have rained for many days. For this reason, the image was given the name "Amitayus Who Brings the Nectar of Rain" (\textit{tshe dpag med bdud rtsi char 'bebs ma}).\textsuperscript{57} The walls of the chamber are covered with murals that include a variety of iconographic representations, in addition to a large portrait of Dol po pa. As the \textit{Descriptive Guide} informs us, the wall murals also include a representation of the Buddha's life: "Along the room's upper register is an arrangement of the Buddha's life story, depicted in twelve acts."\textsuperscript{58} Thus at the uppermost point in the monastery's architecture, in the chapel that is itself rendered as the Buddhist pure realm called "Below None," we find the Buddha's life set forth in its entirety.

\textbf{Conclusion}

\textit{The Buddha Program}

As described above, we suggest that Tāranātha championed Śākyamuni Buddha as a major motif at Phun tshogs gling in order to form a powerful organizing principle that would bind distinct spaces, practices, imagery, and intellectual traditions within a relatively unified whole. We have referred to this work as a "Buddha Program." The Buddha serves as the focus for a wide range of narrative, poetic, and ritual texts within his collected works, including \textit{The Sun of Faith} and the \textit{Painting Manual}. He is found on all three floors of the central building: the assembly hall, the Boundless Array circuit, and the Akaniṣṭha chapel. We likewise find

\textsuperscript{56} See Quintman forthcoming.
\textsuperscript{57} Tāranātha, \textit{Gnas bshad}, 177-8; Zongtse 42.
\textsuperscript{58} Tāranātha, \textit{Gnas bshad}, 177.
repeated convergences between texts and images: The Boundless Array murals illustrate story of *The Sun of Faith* in vivid detail, while the *Painting Manual* serves to help translate the literary into a visual field. The sādhana of the Seven Hero Buddhas brings into a ritual sphere the monastery's primary religious iconography of the Seven Tathāgatas. The massive Buddha images of the central assembly hall evokes the canonical scriptures that serve as a foundation for Phun tshogs gling's religious transmissions. The Buddha's life becomes a repeated theme in which the Buddha is represented in multiple ways: teaching the fundamental texts of the monastery's religious tradition; travelling in India within an extended narrative replete with hundreds of characters; existing as but one of many buddhas of past and present cosmic eons; anchoring the institution as a powerful and miraculous statue connected to the formation of the Tibetan empire; and living his life once again near (in visual terms, at least) the realm that forms the summit of material existence in Buddhist cosmology.

References

**Tibetan and Chinese Language Sources**

Dge ba'i dbang po (Kṣemendra)

*Byang chub sems dpa'i rtogs pa brjod pa dpag bsam gyi 'khri shing. Sde dge Bstan 'gyur, Mdo 'grel (Ke)*, fols. 1-366. Ui 1934, no. 4155.

Ngag dbang blo gros grags pa (1920-1975)

*Dpal ldan jo nang pa'i chos byung rgyal ba'i chos tshul gsal byed zla ba'i sgron me.*

Chos kyi rgya mtsho, Kaḥ thog Si tu (1880–1923/1925)

*Si tu pa chos kyi rgya mtsho'i gangs ljongs dbus gtsang gnas bskor lam yig nor bu zla shel gyi se mo do.* Sichuan: Si khron mi rigs dpe skrun khang, 2001.

Dol po pa Shes rab rgyal mtshan (1292-1361)


Sna nam btsun pa Bskal bzang chos kyi rgya mtsho (late 15th century)

*Mchog gi gter. Sangs rgyas bcom ldan 'das kyi rnam par thar pa rmad du byung ba mdzad pa 'khrlul med par brjod pa bde bar gshegs pa'i spyd pa mchog gi gter. Zi ling* [Xining]: Mtsho sngon mi rigs dpe skrun khang, 1994.

Tāranātha (1575-1634)

—*Dkon mchog gsum. Dkon mchog gsum rjes su dran pa'i mdo don cung zad bshad pa.*
Pe cin [Beijing]: Krung go'i bod rig pa dpe skrun khang, 2008: 24 [Mes po'i shul
bzhag 76], 286-310.


——Dad pa’i nyin byed. Bcom ldan ’das thub pa’i dbang po’i mdzad pa mdo tsam brjod pa mthong bas don ldan rab tu dga’ ba dang bcas pas dad pa’i nyin byed phyogs brgyar ’char ba. [See Taranatha 2003 for a complete translation into French].

Editions


Yan Xue 阐雪. 2014. "Xizang ganden pengcuolin si daijingtang bihua tiji shidu yu yanjia 西藏甘丹彭措林寺大经堂壁画题识记述与研究 [A Study on the Murals of Gtsug lag khang in Dga’ ldan Phunt shogs gling]." Zhongguo zangxue 中国 藏学 (China Tibetology 3:160-169

European Language Sources


Ui, Hakuji, et. al. 1934. A Complete Catalogue of the Tibetan Buddhist Canons. Sendai: Tōhoku Imperial University, 1934. no. 1956


Appendix 1: Assembly Hall Mural Inscriptions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Inscription</th>
<th>Canonical Text</th>
<th>In list of 20 definitive sutras?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>xxx btul ba'i bkod pa bzhugs.ho maṅ ga lam</td>
<td>Subduing [the elephant?]</td>
<td>narrative?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>bden tshags pa'i bkod pa bzhugs.ho</td>
<td>?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>oṁ swa sti 'phrul chen po'i mdo bkod bzhugs.ho</td>
<td>Prātiḥārya-nirdeśa sūtra (D066)</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>oṁ swa sti 'phags pa sprin chen po'i mdo bkod bzhugs.ho maṅ ga lam</td>
<td>Mahāmegha sūtra (D233)</td>
<td>yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Line</td>
<td>Text</td>
<td>Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>སྣ་བ་སྤྲི་ཡབ་སྤྲས་མཐླི་མདོ་ བཟུགས་ཧོ མག་གམ་ལམ</td>
<td>Ārya-pitāputrasamāgamana-nāma-mahāyāna-sūtra (D060)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>སྣ་བ་སྤྲི་ 'ཕྱི་ཕུགས་པ་མོ་གྲོས་མཐོང་ བསྟན་པའི་མདོ་བཀོད་བཟུགས་ཧོ</td>
<td>Āryākṣayamatinirdeśa-nāma-mahāyāna-sūtra (D175)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>'ཕྱི་ཕྱི་ཕུགས་པ་དགེ་པོ་ བསྟན་པའི་མདོ་ བཀོད་བཟུགས་ཧོ</td>
<td>Ārya-suvanaprabhāsottama-sūtra (D556)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>རྒྱུད་པས་སྡེ་སྨོན་སྤྲིན་པའི་ བློ་མདོ་ བཀོད་པ་ བཟུགས་ཧོ</td>
<td>Samdhinirmocana sūtra (D106)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>སྣ་བ་སྤྲི་ བཤེག་ལྡན་ དུས་ཀྱི་'ཁོར་ ལོའི་རི་མདོ་ བྱུགས་པའི་ བློ་མདོ་ བཀོད་པ་ བཟུགས་ཧོ</td>
<td>Kālacakra Root Tantra</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>སྣ་བ་སྤྲི་ 'ཕྱི་ཕྱི་ཕུགས་པ་དེ་བཟུགས་ བསྟན་པའི་སྲིད་པའི་ བཀོད་པོ་ བཀོད་བཟུགས་ཧོ/ གཅོས་བོད་མོ་ཀུན་ལྡེ་ གྱིད། ལྟོགས་པའི་ ཁྲི། མག་གམ་ལམ</td>
<td>Ārya-tathāgatagarbha-nāma-mahāyāna-sūtra (D258)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td>no inscription</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td>illegible</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>སྣ་བ་སྤྲི་ 'ཕྱི་ཕྱི་ཕུགས་པ་ བསྟན་པའི་ བཀོད་པོ་ བཀོད་བཟུགས་ཧོ/ མག་གམ་ལམ</td>
<td>Ārya-laṅkāvatāra-mahāyāna-sūtra (D107)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>སྣ་བ་སྤྲི་ བཤེག་ལྡན་ 'དུས་ སྟོན་པ་ རྒྱུད་ བསལ་ བོམ་ གསོང་པ་ བསྟན་པའི་ བཀོད་པོ་ བཀོད་བཟུགས་ཧོ མག་གམ་ལམ</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>སྣ་བ་སྤྲི་ 'ཕྱི་ཕྱི་ཕུགས་པ་ བསྟན་པའི་ བཀོད་པོ་ བཀོད་བཟུགས་ཧོ</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
<td>illegible</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td></td>
<td>illegible</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td></td>
<td>illegible</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td></td>
<td>illegible</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td></td>
<td>illegible</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td></td>
<td>inaccessible</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td></td>
<td>illegible</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Line</td>
<td>Text</td>
<td>Narrative/Comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>oṃ swa sti 'bar ba'i phug tu lha rnam la</td>
<td>teaching dharma to the gods at Jávlíni</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>oṃ swa sti rgyal chen bzhis bden pa la bkod pa bzhugs.so maṇ ma ga laṃ</td>
<td>?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>illegible</td>
<td>Narrative?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>oṃ swa sti ston xxx xxx spre'u'i xxx</td>
<td>?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>xxx xxx mehog tu bkod pa bzhugs. ho/ maṇ ma ga laṃ</td>
<td>?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>oṃ swa sti yon tan dang ye shes bsam gyis mi khyab pa'i mdo bkod bzhugs.ho/ maṇ ma ga laṃ</td>
<td>Árya-tathāgata-guṇa-jñānācinti yaviṣayāvatāranirdesa-nāma-mahāyāna-sūtra (D185)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>oṃ swa sti gzungs kyi dbang phyug rgyal po'i mdo bkod bzhugs.ho/ maṇ ma ga laṃ</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>rma bya chen mo'i mdo bkod bzhugs.ho (Inscription has been newly written)</td>
<td>Mahāmayūrīvidyārājñī (D559)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>oṃ swa sti 'jam dpal rtsa ba'i rgyud kyi mdo bkod bzhugs.ho/</td>
<td>Árya-mañjuśrī-mūla-tantra (D543)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>oṃ swa sti mdo sde myang 'das chen po'i mdo bkod bzhugs.ho shu bhaṃ/</td>
<td>Árya-mahāparinirvāṇa-nāma-mahāyāna-sūtra (D120)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>oṃ swa sti lha'i gnas su yum la chos gsungs pa'i bkod pa bzhugs.ho maṇ ma ga laṃ</td>
<td>narrative: Buddha teaching mother in heaven</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>oṃ swa sti 'jam dpal rnam par 'phrul ba'i bkod pa bzhugs.ho maṇ ma ga laṃ</td>
<td>Maṇjuśrīvikurvānaparivarta sūtra (D097)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>oṃ swa sti phags pa dkon mehog sprin gyi mdo bkod bzhugs.ho maṇ ma ga laṃ</td>
<td>Árya-ratnamegha-nāma-mahāyāna-sūtra (D231)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>oṃ swa sti lha'i gnas nas slar yang 'jam bu'i gling du byon xxx xxx</td>
<td>narrative: Buddha returns from heaven</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Author: Andrew Quintman, Yale University; Kurtis R. Schaeffer, University of Virginia.
Abstracts

A Study of Vairocana with Eight Bodhisattva Images Discovered in East Tibet

Lu Suwen
(Sichuan University Museum, Chengdu)

Dawa Phuntsok
(Northwest University for Nationalities, Lanzhou)

Recently, carved images of Vairocana with eight accompanying Bodhisattvas of the Tubo period were discovered in East Tibet, and two painted images of the same from the Tubo period were also found in Dunhuang. Here we conclude that these images were derived from Ü-Tsang through a comparison of the features and configuration of these images in combination with research into early Tibetan literature. The images of the eight Bodhisattvas had spread before the occupation of Dunhuang during the Tubo period. The image configuration of Cave 25 at Yulin and the Stein Painting 50ch.0074 at the British Museum from East Tibet in combination with Avatamsaka faith, created the image configurations on both sides of Mañjuśrī and Samantabhadra. And it was a popular motif in East Tibet that, in accordance with the image allocation of the eight Bodhisattva-motif, Vajrapāni and Avalokiteśvara were the two Bodhisattvas aside the principal deity Vairocana.

Many inscriptions from scripture are found in the caves of Dunhuang: Rnam par snag mdzad 'khor dang bcas pa la bstod pa, Sangs rgyas bcom ldan 'das rnam par snag mdzad 'khor dang bcas pa la bstod pa', Sangs rgyas bcom ldas 'das dang byang chub sens dpa' brgyad dang khor bo r bcas pa la bstod pa and the 'Phags pa dkyil 'khor brgyad pa zhes bya ba theg pa chen po'i mdo. The titles of these canonical texts appear in the Dkar chag 'phang thang ma and the Dkar chag lhan/idan dkar ma. Through the interpretation of these inscriptions, we can conclude that the texts on the eight Bodhisattvas as the entourage of Vairocana or Śākyamuni, had spread in Ü-Tsang, East Tibet and Dunhuang. However, the images of this configuration that were recently found demonstrate that the texts and the images of the eight Bodhisattvas did not occur at the same time. According to the names and order of the eight
Bodhisattvas in the texts and images, the texts and images do not correspond exactly, and the spread of these images were affected by the local religious tradition.

文本、图像和寺院组织：达丹彭措林寺佛教故事的初步探究

安德鲁·昆特曼 科蒂斯·谢夫
(耶鲁大学 弗吉尼亚大学)

本文对在西藏自治区后藏地区的达丹彭措林寺开展的一个大型合作项目进行了回顾，以16、17世纪的大学者贡嘎宁波——他更以多罗那他（1575-1634年）之名而闻名——关于释迦牟尼佛传故事的记载为基础，对该寺的佛传故事壁画进行了探讨。本文的主要内容包括：一、多罗那他关于佛陀的文献记载；二、与文献记载相关的佛传故事壁画；三、文本与图像之间的复杂关系，有一处多罗那他书写的壁画题记为主要关系提供了佐证；四、文本和图像产生时寺院的情况。通过这样的分析，我们注意到多罗那他对于释迦牟尼佛的形象在该寺大量出现，对于多罗那他新寺主身份的认定具有重要作用。在寺院，彭措林寺或比大多数的寺院更加强调释迦牟尼佛的独视觉形象。多罗那他对于释迦牟尼佛的重视构成了寺院的核心组织原则，或可被认为是“佛陀项目”：由多罗那他大量的作品、宗教艺术品以及随之产生的宗教实践构成的一个整体的文化项目。我们认为，正是这种文化项目某种程度上巩固了彭措林寺的寺院身份认定。

An Additional Discussion of the Wall Painting of Sudhana's Pilgrimage in Qutan Monastery and the Issues Related to the Sino-Tibetan Cultural Exchange

Dong Huafeng
(School of History and Culture at Sichuan University, Chengdu)

Combined with relevant materials, this article continues doing research on two issues of the wall painting of Sudhana's pilgrimage in Qutan Monastery and the idea of Sino-Tibetan cultural exchange. First, by comparing images, we can determine the basic text of the wall painting of Sudhana's pilgrimage in Qutan Monastery was the Fo guo chan shi wen shu zhi nan tu zan 佛国禅师文殊指南图赞, which was closely related to the imperial family of the Ming Dynasty. Second, according to the comparative analysis on the relevant historical materials, we find that the Wu si zang you fa seng Hai lun 乌斯藏有发僧海论 was
neither a monk in the Song or Qing dynasties. Rather, he was a monk of the Xuande period of the Ming dynasty. He promoted the protection and development of the images of Sudhana's pilgrimage, and because of this he was an ambassador in Sino-Tibetan cultural exchange. The wall painting of Sudhana's pilgrimage in Qutan monastery and the similar images are excellent examples of the multi-layered and deep-seated Sino-Tibetan cultural exchanges that took place in the Ming dynasty.

An Inquiry into the dudie Certificate for Tibetan Buddhist Monks during the Ming Dynasty

Yin Haiyan
(Institute of Nationalities, TASS, Lhasa)

The dudie 度牒 certificate was issued by the Ming government to monks and nuns to prove and ensure their legal status and also limited their number. As an important cultural carrier, Tibetan Buddhism had gradually spread to Gansu, Qinghai, Sichuan, Yunnan, Mount Wutai, the capital and other places. The monks of Tibetan Buddhism made important cultural contributions. That said, they also were on occasion a burden to the state and sometimes were even involved in criminal activities. The management of Tibetan Buddhist monks of the aforementioned areas in the Ming dynasty began with the granting of dudie certificates and mirrors the earlier granting of these certificates to Chinese Buddhist monks.

A Preliminary Study of the Geographical Concept of Rgyalrong and Its Evolution during the Ming and Qing Dynasties

Zou Libo
(Center for Tibetan Studies of Sichuan University, Chengdu)

The readings of the relevant Chinese and Tibetan documents during the Ming and Qing dynasties suggest that the scope of the geographical concept of Rgyalrong changed greatly over different times. At the early formation of Rgyalrong as a geographical concept, Tibetan religion played an essential role in integrating it into the indigenous Tibetan geographical space. In the early and mid-Qing dynasty, Rgyalrong, which was originally constructed based on the idea of "chieftain" politics (土司政治), became fully integrated into the Tibetan intellectual elite's framework of Rgyalrong rgyal khag bco bryad. The Tibetan intellectual elite accepted the geographical concept from central China by coding it with local Tibetan geographical and cultural meanings. The author suggests that the Tibetan religion and its political and cultural relationship with central China are the two major elements in the historical geography of eastern Tibet.
A Textual Study of the *Beri Tusi*

*Li Zhiying*

(Doctoral student, Center for Tibetan Studies of Sichuan University, Chengdu)

This paper discusses the origin, geographical location, the expansionist activities and other aspects of the *Beri Tusi*, "Be ri headmen," who were active in Kham in the late Ming and the early Qing dynasties, and is based on historical records in Chinese and Tibetan. It suggests that the word "Beri" does not originate from "Biri" 必里 in Yuan dynasty sources, and that the latter was a place name in Amdo area. The central domain of the *Beri Tusi* was not the Dkar mdzes area, but today's Chab mdo and Smar khams area. And from this central area, the territory of Beri was expanded through military campaigns. In Beri Don yod rdo rje's reign, the power of Beri principality reached its peak. The vast areas it controlled included Sedge, Ldan khog, Se shul, Chab mdo and Ri bo che, etc.

"Kang" in Gazetteers of Tibet in the Early Period of the Qing Dynasty and the Features of Their Accounts

*Zhao Xinyu*

(Southwest University for Nationalities, Chengdu)

The gazetteers of Xizang in the early Qing dynasty discussed in this article refer to the *Zang jigai* (General Introduction to Xizang 藏纪概) compiled in the middle period of the Yongzheng reign, *Sichuan tongzhi: xiyuzhi* (General Gazetteer of Sichuan: Gazetteer of the Western Region 四川通志· 西域志) compiled at the end of the Yongzheng period, *Xizang zhi* (Textual Investigation into the Gazetteer of Xizang 西藏志) and *Xizang zhi* (Gazetteer of Xizang 西藏志) in the early Qianlong period, and the *Yazhou fuzhi: xiyuzhi* (Gazetteer of Yazhou Prefecture: Gazetteer of the Western Region 雅州府志· 西域志) compiled in the Qianlong period. Except for the *Zangjigai* which only mentions the term "Kang" (Khams 康) in a general sense, the latter four gazetteers provide descriptions and accounts concerning various aspects of the Kang region. These accounts have the following characteristics: 1) *Kang* as recorded in the gazetteers was a part of *Xizang* after the boundaries of Sichuan, Xizang and Yunnan were demarcated in the Yongzheng period, hence, it is not the Khams region in its traditional sense; 2) The gazetteers record various aspects of *Kang* in different ways: it might describe the region first, then portray different aspects of each area, or use events to describe the content in parallel; and 3) The gazetteers mostly recount the nature and society of various places of *Kang* along the Sichuan-Xizang road, and rarely describe those places that were far removed from the main transportation lines. In addition, the gazetteers of Xizang in the early period also use geographical maps to describe the Kang region. Although the accounts in the Xizang gazetteers in the early period of the Qing dynasty are not very comprehensive, yet they are
valuable as sources for research and should thus be noted.

On Jin Chuan’s Strategic Position and Its Connection with Central Tibet and Inland China Based on the Archives of the Qing Dynasty

Wang Huimin

(Post-doctor, School of History and Culture of Shanxi Normal University, Xi’an)

Although Jinchuan, in Tibetan Chu chen and Btsan lha, is located in a remote area in the corner of northwestern Sichuan and was regarded by the Qing Dynasty as a border region with indirect rule, yet, in terms of its strategic position, it was a very important traffic artery between Sichuan and Central Tibet. While one could easily go to Central Tibet from its west, and it is adjacent to Wenchuan and Maowen counties to its east. It also borders on Qinghai to its north, and Ya’an to its south. This was one of the important reasons for the Qing court to launch two large-scale wars at all cost against the tusi (indigenous leaders) of Jinchuan area where there were less than 30,000 soldiers and with limited land. Making use of the newly opened relevant archives of the Qing Dynasty, this essay conducts the textual research and discussion of Jinchuan’s strategic position along the main Sichuan-Tibet communication lines and its various connections with Central Tibet and inland China. This will enrich our understanding of the Jinchuan area ruled by tusi.

A Study of Monasteries and Urban Development of Tibet during the Qing Period

Wang Zhaolei

(The Institute of Urban Studies, Jianghan University, Wuhan)

As important places for religious activities, monasteries played an extremely important role in the formation and development of the city. During the Qing period, having taken advantage of their central role in the political system known as "the Merging of Religion and Politics" and the social background of Buddhism being a national religion, various monasteries in Central Tibet developed into the religious, cultural, economic and political centers of the areas in which they were located. They also figured as one of the core elements in the development of these local regions and had a profound impact on the development and change of the Tibetan urban system, the urban spatial layout, and urban social life. This caused the urban development of Central Tibet to have religious features.
A Study of the Sound of Chanting Rituals in the Assembly of the Dga' Idan Inga mchod at Ganden Monastery, Lhasa

Wang Yingjie
(Master Degree Candidate, Central University for Nationalities, Beijing)

In the field of the anthropology of music, the concept of "conception-behavior-product" has gradually developed into "cognition-behavior-musical sound", which is a three-dimensional theoretical frame. Cao Benye has used it for the conception of Chinese ceremonial music research and proposed further a research frame of "belief-ritual-ritual sound". This study takes the sound of chanting ritual of the Great Dga' Idan Inga mchod (དག་ཡིད་ཤླིང་རྒྱས་མཆོད) ritual as its object, and based on field research in the cultural context of Tibetan Buddhism, it analyzes the microcosmic-emic aspect of Great Dga' Idan Inga mchod in semantic terms. Analyzing the interaction of "belief-ritual-ritual sound", this study explains the religious, societal and cultural aspects in relation Tsongkhapa's notion of reviving Tibetan Buddhism.

青藏高原的区域性形成和多样化模式：网状、等级与催化

杰拉德·罗谢
（墨尔本大学）

本文根据兰达（Manuel de Landa）的“网状结构”和“等级”理论，提出区域性（areality）概念，用以考察地理－文化区域的内在一致性。本文研究的区域是青藏高原东北部的河湟流域。本文认为，该流域的区域性既是等级性的，又是网状结构的。它的等级性来自历史累积、整合和夯实过程。而网状结构则是不同因素受到催化而关联起来的自我组织的、异质性系统。本文研究河湟流域作为一个区域的形成和再塑，通过跨族群的仪式复合体来考察其区域性。这些仪式包括纳顿、博、鲁若和拉孜等。本文认为，区域性概念以及兰达的网状结构和等级概念为我们提供一个分析框架和方法工具，可以富有成效地用于分析青藏高原的其他地方，解释其语言和文化的多样性。
Gender Differences of People's Daily Life in Central Tibet's Rural Area:
A Case Study of Xia Village

Tan Siying
(Doctoral student, Southwest University for Nationalities, Chengdu)

This article explored how gender differences are embedded in the people's daily life by way of a case study of Xia village, Shigatse, of the Tibetan Autonomous Region. Through a few months' field work, it was observed that gender differences exist in people's daily life; in addition, there is a gender division of labor in the Tibetan rural area - men have the role of earning money outside the home and women have the role of housekeepers inside the home.

A.H. Francke and the Initiation of Archaeology in Western Tibet

Yang Qingfan
(Center of Tibetan Studies of Sichuan University, Chengdu)

August Hermann Francke (1870-1930) is a German Tibetologist who was a Moravian missionary worked at western Himalayan areas. This article briefly introduces his life and academic experiences, and reviews his main work on history and archaeology of western Tibet. Furthermore, The paper discusses his pioneering achievement in the archaeology of western Tibet, especially his studies of ancient Tibetan rock inscriptions, Tibetan Buddhist archaeology and even his attempt at doing physical anthropology. A.H. Francke's achievement is closely related to the development of Tibetan Studies and physical anthropology in Europe, and also to the development of archeology and epigraphy in India. It is therefore of some importance to evaluate the works and achievement of A.H. Francke in the academic history of Tibetan Studies and archaeology.
Issues Regarding Old Tibetan Contracts from Dunhuang and Xinjiang

Tsuguhito Takeuchi
(Osaka University of Foreign Studies, Japan)
translated by
Yang Ming, Yang Gongwei
(Southwest University for Nationalities, Chengdu; Xizang Minzu University, Xianyang)

This essay is part of the monograph Old Tibetan Contracts from Central Asia that was written by Japanese scholar Tsuguhito Takeuchi. It is a comparative study of the format of old Tibetan contracts and Chinese contracts found in Dunhuang and Xinjiang. Furthermore, issues concerning the formation, character, writer, social and the linguistic background of the old Tibetan contracts are discussed.
JOURNAL OF TIBETOLOGY (VOL. 13)

Edited by

Center for Tibetan Studies of Sichuan University
Chengdu, China

First Published in December, 2015
China Tibetology Publishing House
Beijing, China
《藏学学刊》稿约

《藏学学刊》（Journal of Tibetan Studies）系中国教育部普通高等学校人文社会科学重点研究基地四川大学中国藏学研究所主办的藏学类专业性学术刊物，CSSCI（2014-2015）来源集刊，创刊于2004年，旨在搭建藏学研究的学术交流平台。从2014年开始，本刊由年刊改为半年刊，接受中、英文稿件，设有论文、书评、译文等栏目，热忱欢迎国内外藏学研究者惠赐稿件。来稿时请注意以下事项：

1. 来稿请注明字数并提供作者简介，包括姓名、出生年月、性别、民族、籍贯、职称、学位、工作单位、联系方式和主要研究方向等，其中姓名和工作单位名称请提供正确的英文译名。

2. 来稿必须为原创性作品，此前未经公开发表。严禁抄袭、剽窃和一稿多投，如有发现，将永不录用该作者来稿。

3. 为保证文稿的准确性，电子版来稿须同时提供word和pdf两种文档格式，并遵循本刊用稿规范（详见本所网页）。来稿字数不限，提倡言简意赅，以一万多字左右为宜。

4. 本刊每期收稿截止日期为每年六月三十日和十二月三十日。该日期以后收到的稿件将纳入下一期的编辑工作。

5. 本刊取舍稿件以学术为标尺，并实行2-3名专家匿名审稿制度，根据专家审稿意见决定稿件取舍。本刊在尊重原作的前提下，有权对拟刊用稿件作必要的删改并告知作者，作者如果不同意对文稿作文字性修改或适当删节，请在来稿时予以说明。

6. 本刊所刊文章均以作者个人观点，不代表编辑部意见，文责由作者自负。

7. 本刊已加入期刊数字化网络系统，作者若无此意愿，请在来稿时注明，否则视为默认。

8. 稿件请直接投寄本刊编辑部。自寄稿之日起，若二个月内未接到用稿通知，可自行处理。来稿除图版原件外，一律不退稿，请作者谅解。

9. 本刊对用稿文稿将支付作者稿酬，并赠送样刊五册。

10. 本刊热忱欢迎国内外学者或编辑部与本刊建立资料互赠交流关系。

地址：中国四川省成都市望江路29号
四川大学中国藏学研究所《藏学学刊》编辑部
邮编：610064
电子邮件：zangxuesuekan@163.com
电话/传真：+86-28-85412567
网址：http://www.zangx.com
Call for Contributions

Founded in 2004, the Journal of Tibetan Studies (ཐིབタン་ཐིབ་ཀྱི་དོན་ཐིབས་) is a peer-reviewed bilingual scholarly journal dedicated to publishing papers in the field of Tibetan Studies. Featuring articles and reviews in either Chinese or English, the journal is published biannually by the Center for Tibetan Studies of Sichuan University, Chengdu, PRC. The *Journal of Tibetan Studies* welcomes the submission of academic and unpublished (and original) work, including the Chinese translation of foreign research and serious, critical reviews of books or review articles, in any area of research that deals with the Tibetan cultural area.

Essential Guidelines:

1. The manuscript should contain information on the total number of words/characters and author's details, including the following information: (1) full name and institutional affiliation; (2) academic title; (3) contact information, (4) the primary field of research.

2. The *Journal of Tibetan Studies* has a zero-tolerance plagiarism policy.

3. Essays and reviews should be submitted electronically in Microsoft Word file and PDF format, using Unicode, to zangxuexuekan@163.com and conform to the style sheet of the *Journal of Tibetan Studies* that is found at the website of the institute. If this is not done, they will automatically be not considered for publication. There is no limit on the length of the manuscript, but we strongly encourage the manuscript to be concise with approximately 10,000 words in English or Chinese.

4. The deadline for the submission of articles and reviews is June 30 of each year. Articles and reviews received and accepted for publication after this date will be considered for the next issue.

5. The *Journal of Tibetan Studies* uses a double-blind review process. Each manuscript is sent to two or three referees for double-blind peer review. Based on their recommendations, the editor then decides whether the manuscript will be accepted as is, whether it needs to be revised, or whether it will be rejected.

6. The views and opinions expressed in the articles and reviews are those of the author alone and do not reflect the views or opinions of the editor(s) or the editorial board. The author is responsible for his/her own views.

7. The journal is already part of the digital network of Chinese journals. If any author does not want to have his or her article published online, please note this upon submitting the manuscript. Otherwise, the editor will take it as tacitly granting permission to do so.

8. The manuscript should be directly submitted to the editor. If one has not received a notice of acceptance for publication within two months since the day the manuscript was submitted, it is within one's discretion to submit the manuscript elsewhere for publication. Excepting the originals of maps, charts or photographs the editor will not return the manuscript to the author.

9. The journal will pay remuneration to the author and send five copies of the issue of the journal in which his or her article appears.

10. Scholars or editorial boards in China and abroad are warmly welcomed to establish a growing network of exchanging copies of journals with the editor of the *Journal of Tibetan Studies*.

Correspondence should be addressed to:
Dr. Zhang Changhong
Center for Tibetan Studies of Sichuan University
Chengdu, Sichuan Province
P.R. China
610064
Email: zangxuexuekan@163.com
Tel/Fax: +86-28-8541 2567
Website: http://www.zangx.com